

The doctrine of love and the stage of the divine cognition, according to the community of the third order of St. Francis of Foligno, at the turn of XIII-XIV centuries

Yulia V. Rodionova

The article presents an analysis of one of the parts of the book of Revelations of blessed Angela of Foligno, which contains the Instructions (message) to members of the community of the third order of St. Francis. The doctrine proposes to consider the relationship with God as an object/subject of love, to which feelings and emotions are directed. The "presence of the divine Beloved" is "cognizable" and can respond by generating sensations of its material presence. The author of the doctrine has practical recommendations (stages of knowledge): how to achieve junction with the divine, what steps should be taken to change the way of life. It is concluded that there was a developed teaching among the members of the community, and its medical aspect is considered.

Key words: religious mysticism, mystical and religious experience, spirituals, XIV century, Angela of Foligno.

Relationships and Activities: not.

Yulia V. Rodionova*, independent researcher, MD; Graduate of Lomonosov Moscow State University, Department of Church History (2012), PhD student of Institute of Scientific Information for Social Sciences of the Russian Academy of Sciences (INION RAN) (Medieval History, 2013-2016); Moscow. ORCID: 0000-0002-6378-6317, IRID: 240336971. Special interests — Medieval History, religious movements.

*Corresponding author: cardio2008@yandex.ru

Received: 23.11.2019

Revision Received: 15.01.2020

Accepted: 21.01.2020

For citation: Yulia V. Rodionova. The doctrine of love and the stage of the divine cognition, according to the community of the third order of St. Francis of Foligno, at the turn of XIII-XIV centuries. *Russian Journal of Church History*. 2020;1(1):4. (In Russ.)

doi:10.15829/2686-973X-2020-1-1-4

The question of the feeling of love as a way of the divine cognition is given little attention in modern historical research. On the one hand, this problem is of a philosophical nature, but on the other hand, understanding how people of the Middle Ages thought, especially those connected with religious service, can bring more precise knowledge to a well-known and established model of social relations. However, representatives of medieval religious movements suggest that there are several stages or steps in the process of cognition. Such a model can be considered an example of text created among the community members of the third order of St. Francis of Assisi in Foligno, at the turn of XIII-XIV centuries. Analysis of the text in this way has not yet been performed by researchers. The article also discusses the medical aspect of changing the way of life of followers of the doctrine, which affects the quality of mystical and religious experience¹.

Philosophical justification of the feeling of love

It is important to note that modern knowledge (cognition) is based on the classical philosophy of rationalism, proposed by Rene Descartes at the beginning of the XVII century [Descartes 1989], and it incorporates all the philosophical views that appeared and developed in the subsequent time. But Descartes still has the distinction of soul and body (dualism), which is formed under the influence of God the Creator², and the philosophical approach itself already lays the line of reasoning — man is a Creator who knows the world around him with the help of reason (racio), and the famous *Cogito ergo sum* once again confirms the transition to a new philosophy, when a person begins to know himself and the world around him, but separately from God.

However, since the subject of this article belongs to the time of the end of the XII — beginning of the XIV centuries, the philosophical rationale for some of the appeals that took hold of the minds of the masses of people at this time is somewhat different. This historical time just gave rise to various well-known religious groups and movements that are currently being studied. It should also be noted that without understanding their philosophical views, it is impossible to make accurate conclusions in terms of historical science, using only a materialistic approach.

¹ **Limitations of the study.** The study of the “presence of the divine Beloved” was made on one source, and no comparative analysis was conducted with other known texts of a similar genre. The revealed stages in the part of the Doctrine were not compared with the plots from the first two parts of the book of Blessed Angela of Foligno. The physiological sensations of the “divine presence” need to be investigated separately, using evidence from a vast database of sources.

² “For, in the first place, the very rule which I have adopted, namely, that the things which we conceive quite clearly and distinctly are all true, is valid only because God is, or exists, and is the perfect being from whom all that is in us proceeds”.

From the end of the XII century, scholastic philosophy appeared and developed, and various Church figures began actively studying the writings of Plato and Aristotle, information about which is given in sufficient detail in any essay on medieval philosophy. However, it should be noted that the philosophers made their conclusions for a certain cultural cross-section of the society of that time — that is, for the same intellectuals who were themselves, but did not form a general public opinion. Therefore, the source used in this analysis is “The book of the Revelations of Blessed Angela of Foligno” [*Acta Sanctorum*; Stegman 1909; Karsavin 1918] (hereinafter — “The book of Revelations...”) is interesting in that it sets out the provisions of the doctrine, not widely recognized by contemporaries, but supported by some social groups, and which was on the verge of being recognized as heretical. It is important to note that the teaching that originated within the urban community should not contain complex intellectual reflections, and should be close to the masses who understood it.

There are quite a little tracts of other philosophers, not recognized by the official Church authorities, who presented their own point of view on the relationship between God and man, and, accordingly, all of them remain poorly studied, for example, Peter John Olivi [*Burr* 1993], Umbertino Casale [*Ubertino da Casale* 1485], Joachim da Fiore [*Gioacchino da Fiore* 1994; *Andrea Tagliapietra* 2013], Arnold of Villanova [*Field* 2012], Raimund Lullius [*Ramón Lull* 1923]. The works of so-called women mystics (for example, Hildegard of Bingen, Marguerite of Poret, Angela of Foligno, Marguerite of Cortona, Clara of Assisi, Clara of Montefalco, Teresa of Avila, and others) have been studied³ by western researchers since the late eighties of the last century.

The general tendency of the philosophical exposition of the writers listed above concerned the relationship of man with God: the parts of man (body, soul, mind) and the divine parts (God the Father, God the Son, the Holy Spirit). In the philosophy of these authors, the significance of the material world as something vain and not worth attention is leveled, and much attention is given to the spiritual world, since the ultimate goal of any human soul is unity with the divine. “And when will the Beloved see the Lover who has lost consciousness from love for Him?” — asks in his “Book of the Lover and the Beloved” Raimund Lullius [*Ramón Lull* 1923:24].

³ For example, Benvenuti Papi A. (1990) *In castro poenitentiae*; Bel R. M. (1985) *Holy Anorexia*; Bornstein D. and Rusconi R. (1992) *Mistiche e devote nell'Italia tardomedievale*; Bynum C. W. (1992) *Fragmentation and Redemption: Essays on Gender and the Human Body in Medieval Religion*; Bynum C. W. (1987) *Holy Feast and Holy Fast: The Religious Significance of Food to Medieval Women*; Bynum C. W. (1982) *Jesus as Mother: Studies in the Spirituality of the High Middle Ages*; Carpenter J. and MacLean S-B (1995), ed., *Power of the Weak: Studies on Medieval Women*; Goodich M (1981) *The Contours of Female Piety in Later Medieval Hagiography*; Matter E. A. and Coakley J. (1994) *Creative Women in Medieval and Early Modern Italy: A Religious and Artistic Renaissance*; Merlo G. G. (1993) *Santità e condizione femminile nella Toscana medievale*; Newman B. (1995) *From Virile Woman to Woman Christ: Studies in Medieval Religion and Literature*; Petroff E. A. (1980) *Consolation of the Blessed: Women Saints in Medieval Tuscany*; Petroff E. A. (1994) *Body and Soul: Essays on Medieval Women and Mysticism*.

It should also be noted other possible reasons for the manifestation of an indifferent attitude to the outside world: in some sectarian heretical views, the devil was pointed out as the Creator of all visible things, respectively, the meaning of knowing the visible (material) world as a devilish creation was denied⁴, and thought focused on the invisible, God-created world and the ways, possibilities, or ways to achieve union with God.

The feeling of love at the time described was not a substance produced by the human body, but was represented by energy originating from outside [Lossky 2012:95-129], which is generated by the divine essence. The tradition of considering divine love as the highest manifestation of Love comes from the work of Dionysius the Areopagite "On Divine names" (Chapter 4: 13)⁵ [Areopagite 1994].

From the point of view of medicine, it is proved that certain parts of the brain are responsible for the occurrence of "passionate" love [Ortigüe 2010], so their internal stimulation can lead to a stable hormonal response. However, the feeling of love is only studied as an emotion (responding to an image, smell, or taste) [Burunat 2019], but most cases where a material object may not exist are overlooked.

Thus, at the end of the XII century and the beginning of the XIV century, there were reasons to perceive the relationship with the divine through the feeling of love that appears, sent by this very divine. Through the perception of this feeling within oneself, one could respond by merging one's soul with the energy emanating from God.

Description of the source

The historical source of this study was one of the parts of "The book of the Revelations of Blessed Angela of Foligno" [*Acta Sanctorum*; Stegman 1909; Karsavin 1918]⁶, which, in turn, is a unique

⁴ For example, Ermengaud of Beziers says of the Cathars: "this world and all that is visible, namely, the sky that we see, the sun, the moon, the stars, the earth and all animals and people, and the water that can be seen, the sea and fish, and everything that is visible and existing in it, is not the creation of an Almighty God, but of the leader of evil spirits" (*Haeretici dicunt et credunt mundum istum, et omnia quae in eo videntur, videlicet coelum, quod videmus, et solem, et lunam, et stellas, et terram, et omnia animalia, et homines, et ea aquae in ea videntur, mare et pisces, et omnia quae in eo videntur vel sunt, ab omnipotendi Deo non esse acta, sed a principe malignorum spirituum*). Ermengaudus. Contra haereticos. Clementis III, pontificis romani epistolae et privilegia, ordine chronologico digesta... accurante J.-P. Migne, (Petit-Montrouge) 1855, Waitz, Georg (1813-1886). Éditeur scientifique, cc.1235-1279.

⁵ "...divine love is directed outward: it encourages those who love to belong not to themselves, but to the beloved. The higher ones show this by their concern for the needy, those on the same level by their connection with each other, and the lower ones by their more divine appeal to the first — rate ones. Why did the great Paul, being possessed by divine Love, and having joined of its outward-looking power, say with divine lips: "I no longer live, but Christ lives in me" (Tal. 2, 20). He said this as a true lover, exasperated from himself, as he says, to God, and living not his own life, but the life of the Beloved as very desirable."

⁶ For more information about Karsavin's translation, see Klestov, A. A. (2018). Translation of the "Revelations of blessed Angela" into Russian by L. P. Karsavin and its meaning. *Philosophical polylogue: Journal of the International center for the study of Russian philosophy*, (3), 102-124. doi:10.31119/phlog.2018.3.7

source about the life and views of one of the many communities of followers of the third order of St. Francis of Assisi (from the laity), which developed around a woman, later recognized as blessed, and was strongly supported by the Franciscan brothers of the city of Foligno (Italy). By itself, “The book of Revelations...” of bl. Angela stands out for its narrative structure is not typical for “classic” forms of the saint’s life, but this form is found in the end of XIII century — beginning of XIV century: when a Franciscan friar, writes a narrative “from the words” women. However, in addition to the narrative part, this work contains a unique exposition of the doctrine that was peculiar to a separate branch of the spiritual Franciscans, who were later recognized as heretics. Spiritual Franciscans in the late 20s of the XIV century lost their battle for the right to be called heirs of the true teachings of St. Francis, but left their mark in the development of knowledge of the way to God⁷.

“The book of Revelations...” contains a fairly voluminous medieval text, the author of which is named Angela of Foligno (1248-1309), beatified in 1701 (according to other sources — in 1693). The text was written by a follower of bl. Angela is friar Arnaldo, translating everything the woman said to him in the local Italian dialect into Latin⁸.

About two hundred years after the book was written, the name of Angela of Foligno was forgotten because of the famous controversy about the poverty of Christ, the ideal of which is laid down in the part of the book devoted to “doctrine”. At the end of the XVII century suddenly appeared about 28 manuscripts containing records of “The book of Revelations...”, which, of course, is associated with the work of Bollandists and the initiation of the question of canonization. The first printed edition, a translation from Latin into vernacular Italian, was published in 1497 in Vicenza, but there is a similar translation from 1510. Then “The book of Revelations...” was translated into other languages — Spanish (1510, Toledo), French (1604, bollandist edition), German (1617), and then these translations were reprinted many times.

“The book of Revelations...” consists of three main parts: 1. Conversion and repentance, 2. Visions and consolations, 3. Doctrine. After numerous reprints, the book acquired a number of divergent features: the tradition from the bollandist Genschen (Henschenius, *Acta Sanctorum*, 1604) supplements the Italian translation of 1510 with two prefaces from friar Arnaldo and a number of his comments on the text.

⁷ General study: Burr, D. (2001) *The Spiritual Franciscans*. The Pennsylvania State University Press. p. 428. Treatises: Angelo Clareno (2005) *A Cronicle or History of the seven Tribulations of the order of Brothers minor*. Transl. D. Burr and E. R. Daniel. The Franciscan Institute, St. Bonaventure University; Ubertino da Casale (1485) *Arbor vitae crucifixae Jesu Christi*. Venezia, Andrea de Bonettis. Ospitato su Biblioteca de Catalunya. URL <http://mdc.csuc.cat/cdm/ref/collection/incunabileBC/id/136400>

⁸ See *Acta Sanctorum* in the 1604 edition with prefaces (the testimony of friar Arnaldo himself); Angela of Foligno (1993) *Complete works*, translated, with an introduction by Paul Lachance; preface by Romana Guarnieri. New York: Paulist Press, 1993, pp.47-50.

Revisions made before 1309 (the year of bl. Angela death) and in 1309–1310, introduced some editing, but did not smooth out the roughness of the text of the Doctrine, similar to a collection of individual addresses to followers or sermons. In any case, “The book of Revelations...” as a whole is a collective creative work that did not achieve its goal in the early XIV century under Pope Clement V in 1309–1310, and then because of the beginning of the persecution of spirituals by Pope John XXII in 1318 [more — *Kotlyarevsky* 1901:309, 328], but it corresponded to the form of a canonical statement of the principles of faith (an appeal to followers in the form of a sermon). This work is unique in its essence: under the developed doctrine of salvation, the life of a Saint was compiled, who directly received Divine revelations that fully confirm the views of certain groups of spirituals in the Franciscan order.

It should be noted that there are a sufficient number of publications devoted to the work of Angela of Foligno, but most of them consider the author as a person, a woman, a mystic, including a group of similar women who left written “revelations”, but do not consider Angela as a member of the community. Accordingly, the identity of Angela has been studied in detail⁹, but the daily life of the tertiarii community is presented and described very sparsely [*Rodionova* 2014:33–38]. The main object of research is often the first two parts of “The book of Revelations...”, and the text of the Doctrine (the third book) is not published in publications¹⁰. Two works have been published in Russian literature over the past ten years: an article by the author¹¹ and an article based on it on the study¹² of the text from a literary point of view — the genre of revelations¹².

⁹ For example, *The Shocking Mysticism of Angela of Foligno* (2006), Tyler Simons, describes how Angela could be perceived by her contemporaries (friar Arnaldo) and how she can be perceived by a modern reader; *Angela da Foligno's Memoriale: The Male Scribe, the Female Voice, and the Other* (2005), Dino S. Cervigni, discusses the relationship between Angela and God; *Connecting with the God-Man: Angela of Foligno's Sensual Communion and Priestly Identity* (1998), Molly G. Morrison, Angela's relationship with Christ and her own prayer activities are studied; *In Search of the Subject: Angela of Foligno and Her Mediator* (1994), Daria Valentini, discusses the role of friar Arnaldo and Angela's love concept; *The Mystical Journey of Angela of Foligno* (1987), Paul Lachance, the stages (steps) described in the Visions are analyzed; *In the midst of the Trinity. Angela of Foligno's Trinitarian Theology of Communion* (2004) Diane V Tomkinson, studying the teaching of bl. Angela on the Holy Trinity; or general works on female mysticism: Cristina Mazzoni (2005) *The Women in God's Kitchen: Cooking, Eating, and Spiritual Writing*; Bernard McGinn (1998) *The Flowering of Mysticism: Men and Women in the New Mysticism (1200–1350)*; Elizabeth Petroff (1994) *Body and Soul: Essays on Medieval Women and Mysticism*.

¹⁰ In English-language publications are distinguished two parts: *Memoriale w Instruções*. Last full translation Angela of Foligno (1993) *Complete works*, translated, with an introduction by Paul Lachance; preface by Romana Guarrieri, (New York: Paulist Press), recent publications of translations in an abbreviated version, for example: Angela da Foligno (2013) *Memoriale*, ed. Enrico Menestò, Florence (SISMEL/Edizioni del Galluzzo). ISBN: 978-88-8450-488-3. Sant'Angela da Foligno (2017) *Il Memoriale*. Opere dei Santi. Le Vie della Cristianità. ISBN:1326936514, 9781326936518.

¹¹ The revelations of Blessed Angela — the problem of authorship of visions. The Magazine Samizdat. Moscow, 2009 [Electronic resource]. Access mode: samlib.ru/r/rodionova_i_w/beata_angela.shtml

¹² Toporova, A.V. (2017). “The book” by Angela da Foligno as a sample of the genre of revelations. Bulletin of Kostroma state University, 23 (1), 78–82.

The purpose of this article is to analyze the text of the third part of “The book of Revelations...” from the position of revealing the attitude to the question of love in the cognition of the divine, which was broadcast to members of the community in Foligno and followers of the Doctrine. The Doctrine has already been divided by the author into logical parts (sermons) describing the gradual process of improving the human soul and merging it with the divine. For consideration, the thematic breakdown proposed by the author of the Doctrine is accepted.

Historical background of the doctrine

In general, on the basis of historical data and extant sources, new philosophical direction, timid as begun in the late XII century the movement of the Waldensians, “the poor from Lyon”. According to legend¹³, its founder Waldo was influenced by two things: the story of St. Alexius, a Roman patrician of the IV-V centuries, who left wealth for a begging life in Syria, and the recommendations of certain theologians, who answered the question: what is the right and perfect way to reach God, “if you want to be perfect, go and sell everything you own” (Mark 10:22). From that moment, Waldo divided his property, leaving part of it to his wife and daughters, and began to get rid of his own part, he also walked the streets and distributed money to the poor, saying that no one can serve God and Mammon at the same time. Many people thought he was crazy. According to some of the dogmatic foundations of the faith of the medieval Waldensians (followers of Waldo), they believed that the Holy Scripture is enough to lead a person to salvation, anyone has the right to preach the word of God, Jesus is the only mediator between God and people. The ideas of this movement are continued in franciscanism. In the first Chapter of his Rule (1221), St. Francis [*Origins of franciscanism* 1996:44] repeats the words of Jesus Christ: “If you want to be perfect, go and sell your property and give it to the poor; and you will have treasure in heaven; and come and follow Me” (Matt. 19: 21), “If anyone wants to follow Me, reject yourself, and take up your cross, and follow Me” (Matt. 16: 24), “If a man comes to Me and does not hate his father and mother, and wife and children, and brothers and sisters, and even his own life, he cannot be my disciple” (Lk. 14: 26), “and whosoever shall leave houses, or brothers, or sisters, or father, or mother, or wife, or children, or lands, for the sake of My name, shall receive a hundredfold, and shall inherit eternal life” (Matt. 19:29).

¹³ Two Chronicles tell about the Waldensian movement — *Chronicon universalis anonymi Laudunensis* (Laon Anonymos). Georg Waitz (ed.) *Monumenta Germaniae Historica, Scriptores*, vol 26, pp.447-9; trans. in R.I. Moor (ed.), *The Birth of Popular Heresy, Documents of Medieval History I* (London, 1975), pp.111-13, и *Vita Alexandri Papae* (Life of Pope Alexander III, Richard Poities). G. Gooner (ed.) *Enchiridion fontium valdensium* (Recueil critique des sources concernant les Vaudois au moyen age) du III^e Concile de Lateran au Synode d Chanforan (1179-1532), vol. 1 (Torre Pellice, 1958), pp. 164-6.

Thus, creating his order, St. Francis offers the path not only of individual but also of collective striving for holiness, and repeats the ideals of Evangelical poverty. Those who accept the words of Christ that “it is more convenient for a camel to pass through the eye of a needle than for a rich man to enter the Kingdom of heaven” (Matt. 19: 24), “take with you neither gold, nor silver, nor copper in your belts, nor a bag for the journey, nor two garments, nor shoes, nor a staff, for the laborer is worthy of food” (Matt. 10:9-10). In this way, a large number of people with religious fervor and striving for Evangelical ideals, some of whom may have joined the Waldenses, who form the opposition movement, fall into submission to the Roman Church. Also, the Franciscans are joined by a large number of laypeople who do not join the order itself, but lead a life close to the proposed ideal.

By the end of the XIII century, spiritual Franciscans who seek to return to the ideals of St. Francis begin to fight for the purity of the poverty movement [more — *Burr* 2001]. The key issue of the ideological struggle with the official papal authority is the question of the poverty of Christ. If we turn to our study of the text of the Doctrine, this question is the starting point of all subsequent ideology. If it were recognized that Christ was poor, then all the postulates of the Doctrine would form the basis of a new worldview for people who became followers of the doctrine of poverty, and all philosophical reflections on the perfection and deification of the soul, its growth in divine love, could be studied by subsequent generations within the subject of the history of philosophy.

Epistle on the divine cognition from the book of Revelations

In view of the above, let us consider the Doctrine that is set in “The book of Revelations...” Since there is no clear confirmation of who is actually the author of this part of the book, we will call him “the Author of the Doctrine”, and those to whom directed-line appeal — “disciples of the Doctrine.” This division should be clearly understood, since the author’s goal is to convey his message to those who will hear and perceive it [*History of subjectivity* 2009]. Therefore, based on the analysis of the text, it can be concluded that the followers of the Doctrine are not Church people, not scientists, not endowed with power, but those who have family ties and income, which they are invited to give up in the future. These people have a profession and live by the fruits of their labor. There is nothing to indicate that they are engaged in commerce (i.e., usury or outbound trade), while there is no indication that the work of these people is heavy, there is no mention of earning money anywhere; there is a mention that these people take care of their bodies, strive for education, can read and sing, they have many friends, they also perform basic Church rites, believe in the help of saints, prayers and

Church sacraments. They are encouraged to leave their family and friends, but nowhere is there a call to leave their husband (wife) or children. This is a very important remark that points to the appeal to young people whose wealth is supported by their parents, and they themselves are only on the path of their formation.

The Author of the Doctrine is hidden from us behind the identity of bl. Angela, but here we can make a number of assumptions. The Author knows the Scripture, but does not use many biblical quotes in his speech, and also tries to avoid analogies with the text of Scripture in his statements, he was educated, because he presents his own thoughts in a consistent and logical order. The Author may be able to read and write independently, or may have a person who can do it. The Author is known not only among the community of his city, because some people write to him and ask him. He also has a place where he lives, where the sent letters can reach him. In his Doctrine, there is a reference to the vision of the Divine light, which may indicate indirectly familiarity with the hesychastic practices adopted in Greece and the East, but before the appearance of the works of Gregory Palama [*Gregory (Palama)* 2007], which made them known in Italy after the middle of the XIV century.

The narrative is constructed in the form of sermons, although it is divided into chapters by subsequent revisions.

The foundations of mystical connection

The basis of the mystical process of connecting the soul with God, according to the author of the Doctrine, is “the arrival of God in the soul “unnamed and unsolicited”, and if you describe this action in the framework of subject-object relations, the subject (in this case, God) begins to affect the object (the human soul) by “supposing in the soul a certain fire, a certain love, a certain unusual sweetness”. Thus, the soul is assumed to have a set of senses that it can identify and recognize. After the soul understands the presence of God in itself, and also accepts the totality of the divine influence as “grace”, which “delights”, it sensually responds to the presence of God. Then the author of the Doctrine writes that God speaks to the soul “the sweetest words, in which the soul enjoys and feels much”. It should be noted that the text of “The book of Revelations...” contains a model of the conversation between the three hypostases of God and bl. Angela, which she clearly distinguished in the dialogues, as well as the verbal formula for expressing divine love, which was considered correct in this historical time, although in modern socio-cultural times such an expression may have a different meaning.

Since “doubt” remains in the soul, it is dispelled by the soul’s feeling of love and “Divine fire”, as well as by receiving certain knowledge that it “has never heard from any mortal”. After the soul is convinced of the presence of the divine in it, it agrees with it truly

and in everything, and “all the members of the body agree with the soul, and they become truly one with the soul, do not resist its will”, the soul “desires what is divine”. The Author of the Doctrine also says that sometimes it is given to the soul “to see It, and to see it in itself without a bodily image.” This is a very interesting observation from the point of view of the theological concept of God, which cannot be seen physically, but in her Visions bl. Angela sees herself in God and in light (the practices of the hesychast monks, the doctrine of Tabor Light [*Gregory (Palama)* 2007]) and in darkness (Gregory of Nyssa on “shining darkness” [*Gregory of Nyssa* 2000]).

Thus, the Author of the Doctrine informs his followers, to whom he addresses, that a believer, a follower of the Doctrine, must begin to feel “something” within himself. The voices inside tell him, “I love you”. The follower likes it, and increasingly tries to capture the wonderful state in which he is loved.

The soul knows the presence of God in it in other ways: the Doctrine speaks of two. The first is a kind of “anointing”, after which “the soul hears and feels” that God is speaking to it. The second is a kind of “embrace” with which God embraces the soul, after which it understands that Jesus Christ is in it. Thus, the cognition of God by the soul passes from the inner sense perception to the level of bodily perception (many examples of similar physical contact with the divine are given in historical sources).

In the process of cognition of the presence of God in the soul, there is also a process of “acceptance”, which, according to the Author of the Doctrine, makes a person dare to talk about God less, the more he knows it. Also, the presence of the divine “transcends Reason, and all that can in any way be thought, expressed, or understood”. Thus, we can say that in the Doctrine there is a distinction in the cognition (feeling the effects of the outside object), which in fact becomes also a subject in this case we can talk about a subject-subject relationship between God and man: Mind, Soul, Sensuality and the Body: “the body obeys the soul, the sensuality of the mind”, but the mind tells the soul, and the soul — body and sensuality. Accordingly, the primary effect is produced by the divine on the soul, and then on all the other components of man as a subject. At the same time, all carnal (sinful) pleasures are produced on the body, and then on the sensuality, the mind, and the soul.

Before talking about love, the Author of the Doctrine begins with a discussion about self-deception that can happen to spiritual people. The first happens when “love in the soul is not pure, but is mixed with it and there is with it something of love for oneself and one’s own, that is, of one’s own will”. Namely, love is expressed to the world that attracts and supports this love, but these feelings are false, according to the Author of the Doctrine. And since the external world evokes emotions, they remain in the body, but do not enter the soul. The second is when a spiritual person feels loved by

God and is so sure of it that he does not feel the measure, so God allows deception to be committed. The third type of deception is committed when a person decides to please Christ with his whole being, but, as the author of the Doctrine writes, “it is necessary that the soul be able to preserve its own and return to God what is divine”. Thus, the soul must improve gradually, being filled with “self-knowledge”.

The Author of the Doctrine in this case once again emphasizes how to distinguish between the true perception of the doctrine of divine love and the feeling of self-deception (doubt) that may appear.

Thus, the Author of the Doctrine suggests the first step (stage) to the cognition of the divine: through the feeling of an invisible presence, which must be constantly cultivated not only inside, but also find a response in the body and mind.

Worldly good

However, in order to improve and be filled with God, according to the Author of the Doctrine, a person first needs to give up all earthly goods, feelings and aspirations. This postulate leads us to the main problem that underlies almost all heretical teachings and trends approved by the official Church authorities of the historical time described — poverty, since the attitude to it was a controversial issue [Bailey 2003]. In order for the soul to be able to improve, the Author of the Doctrine suggests not only the rejection of all material goods, but also of all unnecessary intimacy with men and women, all unnecessary knowledge and desire to know a lot of new things, all unnecessary business and occupation. The next step is to think about what a person has done, is doing, and will do in the future, and what it will be like for him to deserve it after death.

And the last step is the knowledge of the mercy of God, which implies the mercy shown by Jesus Christ to his tormentors and to all people. Since the ultimate goal of a believing Christian is the Kingdom of Heaven, the cognition of God and oneself is impossible without knowing the life of the God-man: how he was crucified and suffered, giving a pattern of life that involves constant contemplation and knowledge of the God-man crucified. The Author of the Doctrine calls to know the love of God the Son through sorrow and suffering, because the human soul, through these feelings, can “be transformed into Him”. Further, the thought develops: when the human soul is illuminated by the Divine light, it begins to experience and mourn its own sins, that it was the cause of the suffering of Jesus Christ. Also, the idea of self-abasement is supported by the New Testament example of how the Supreme being-God became the poorest, suffering, despised, disgraced and abused, which gives the basis for the entire ideological movement of the XIII century — *imitacio Christi*, whose official ideologue was St. Francis. It is nece-

ssary to emphasize an important point of such a judgment — Christ and his apostles were imitated, but nobody has declared himself to be Christ or apostle, which is an important feature that separates the doctrine, which could be accepted as the development of philosophical thought in the knowledge of the world around, from heresy.

Thus, after feeling the divine presence, in order to advance further, a person must perform some actions independently: 1. Renounce earthly goods or satisfaction of basic human needs (desires, aspirations, drives that cause emotions aimed at activating external activities); 2. Think about yourself as a sinful person and about your future, in which sins will only increase if you do not change qualitatively; 3. To be in constant grief, to feel guilt, and to feel compassion for the crucified Jesus Christ. This is the next step in the perfection of the soul.

Divine good

The Doctrine develops the idea of what is good. Two states are mentioned, one stronger than the other: *being filled with the uncreated God* and *being filled with the God-man-sufferer*, while retaining one of these states is considered a good thing. To get pleasure from God, it is necessary to “know God in truth”. Cognition “outside, outwardly” — in Scripture, words, in the likeness of some creature, and inwardly — “understanding Its highest value” and “the highest good”, which is determined by beauty, sweetness, sublimity, virtue, goodness, generosity, charity and goodness. Involved in the Supreme soul is affected in this highest love, because God is the highest love, and showing Lover feelings, and “soul, inflamed in the divine love, the power of love is transformed in God his Beloved”, “it becomes the divine and is transformed in God without changing its essence”. This state, according to the Author of the Doctrine, the soul can only get through the Divine light and grace of God, and these two things are achieved by “devoted, pure, continuous, humble, and strong prayer”, by studying and pondering the “Book of Life”, which designates the entire mortal life of Christ. Thus, the Author of the Doctrine singles out the “legitimate sons” of God the Father, who improve their souls through poverty, sorrow and humiliation. And only legitimate sons are allowed to cognize God.

Accordingly, the new convert is given the next stage for self-improvement: the transition from inner self-contemplation and vague feelings to concrete actions. A follower of the Doctrine reflects on God, reads the Scripture, or simply prays. Outwardly, at this stage, he is asked to reject all the benefits of external life: to distribute property, to eat alms, to walk in rags, to feed fleas. And this explains the essence of self-abasement: the soul is not part of the body, so the body in this case can be neglected. At the same time, the general state of a person is already at a different stage — he no longer feels

uncomfortable with changes in life, his aspirations are directed to prayer, and he is preparing to accept the highest divine love by obtaining a certain revelation. And this, according to the Author of the Doctrine, is precisely a good: something that benefits and gives pleasure.

Three elements for transformation in God

Let's review the Doctrine, three elements that lead to transformation in God: a "perfect continually, and the highest poverty", "completely sustained and higher contempt" and "absolutely relentless and supreme grief".

The Author of the Doctrine distinguishes the threefold (three-step) poverty of Jesus Christ: great, large, connected with the first, and perfect, connected with the first and second. The first degree was that Jesus Christ did not have any property (temporary things of the world), any material things he accepted as help in extreme bodily need. The second degree was the rejection of intimacy with friends, family, and influential people. The third degree of poverty is a kind of deprivation of the power of oneself, i.e. of one's power as a God-man, by which one has given permission to torment and crucify oneself. He also deprived himself of wisdom, and was a man "ignorant, unreasonable, and foolish among the people of the world", though he humbly preached the truth. Third, Jesus Christ deprived himself of the glory of "holiness, goodness, and integrity", he kept his way in secret, wanted to be counted among criminals and robbers, so that everyone would consider him a sinner, a friend of sinners, a traitor and a traitor. Fourthly, he deprived himself of power and primacy over all things and dominions, did not want to be a king, but was obedient and subordinate to other kings, paid taxes, submitted to the courts, accepted punishments, obeyed his mother and his betrothed father, suffered persecution, and served his own disciples. The Author of the Doctrine calls for following the path of Christ and being in a state of submission, avoiding being in charge, and seeking humility. Thus, in the words of the Doctrine once again highlighted the contemporary situation in the cultural aspirations of the society of the turn of XIII-XIV centuries: all call themselves Christians, but shy away from poverty, and worse — when it is done "reading and understanding in this Book of Life (i.e. priests): saturate with drink and food around the world, adorn themselves with robes, live in palaces with family and friends, are considered to be well-versed in the sciences".

The second element that Jesus Christ maintained in his life was utter contempt (humiliation, embarrassment and shame), because, according to the Author of the Doctrine, he lived as a "humiliated slave", who is considered "wrong and evil", because not only endured shame on the eve of his death, but also in the earthly life resisted all

who wanted to do him worldly honor. He was exiled in infancy, he was called a Samaritan, an idolater, a demoniac, a false prophet, and so on. thus, many episodes from the life of Jesus Christ are considered by the Author of the Doctrine to be examples of ridicule, mockery, and betrayal. This leads the follower of the Doctrine to the idea that the manifestation of humility and patience to the outside world, to the society that will show all these features of the persecutors of Christ, is a clear indicator that the follower is just on the right path of Christ. It also shows the attitude of the society of the time described to those people who began to lead such a life, which the Doctrine calls for. The transfer of any “shame and confusion” that God will allow is the price for the great gifts and rewards that await the follower of the Doctrine in the future.

The third element was called sorrow, although it is characterized by the Author of the Doctrine as the greatest torment in contemplating and understanding all the misfortunes that Christ will have to endure in the future, and which caused Him the greatest sorrow. To clarify, the Author of the Doctrine says first of all that the divine soul was connected with the human body and, accordingly, filled with wisdom: to know everything about your future. The Author also speaks about the bodily sufferings that were suffered by Jesus Christ during his stay in the human body. The God-man felt sorrow for all the lost human race and for the souls of the living, felt compassion for himself, for God the Father, who for the sake of saving people gave his beloved Son, for the Mother, since his flesh was taken from her, for his apostles and disciples. There was also grief for “insulting the Father whom he most loved”, because he saw this insult in the actions of people involved in the crucifixion of the Son. Mention is also made of the torments that Christ endured, not physically, but mostly morally, before his crucifixion: the worst cruelty of hardened hearts, the malice and meanness of great anger and hatred, the malice and cunning of tongues, the infliction of cruel torments and violence, which an ordinary person may encounter in a social environment, and which must be accepted with humility, patience, and charity. Moreover, according to the Author of the Doctrine, addressing his followers, Jesus voluntarily chose, accepted and loved this path full of suffering, because he claimed that “no one can achieve eternal glory in any other way than through sorrows, torments and trials”. At this stage, the Author draws a peculiar line under his arguments, offering his own followers the true path they should follow. Namely, suffering, when earthly executions are a cure for sins. Pain, suffering, and calamities should be endured with patience and joy, for everything is done by the permission of God, and Christ is an example of Divine perfection.

So, as has been studied, the main postulate of the Doctrine indicates that “the knowledge of God uncreated and God-man-sufferer” is absolutely necessary for the transformation of the spirit into His love.

Self-knowledge is made through reflection and prayer, in which you should persist and not fill yourself with other things.

Prepared for the next degree (acceptance of God), the follower of the Doctrine must psychologically conduct internal work on himself and perform the following actions:

- complete abandonment of property,
- complete refusal to communicate with a well-established circle of people from birth (family, friends, members of the community in which he lives),
- giving up the pursuit of knowledge (focusing on prayer, confession, and a specific story about the sacrifice of Jesus Christ),
- acceptance of humility and obedience (allowing punishments in relation to yourself, “depersonalization”),
- accepting yourself as an outcast of society,
- contempt for social norms,
- voluntary acceptance of suffering — internal (for example, diseases of the body, feelings of hunger or thirst) and external (for example, cold, lack of comfort).

Love of God as the highest virtue

Let us consider the “gifts” that a follower of the Doctrine receives when he renounces society and the sense of bodily comfort, since all of the above changes concern the greater part of the body and mind, and not the soul that was involved in the beginning. When the renunciation of “earthly goods” is achieved, the constant feeling of sorrow must be replaced by a certain feeling of love for God, in which the follower will constantly remain.

The Author of the Doctrine calls the greatest and main virtue “love for God and neighbor”. The soul is inflamed into love and transformed into God, and “loves all that God loves”. Therefore, the soul does not judge anyone, it becomes more and more humble, seeing the shortcomings of its neighbor and its own. Humility is the “root” from which all virtues originate, and it is found through pure prayer, looking into the Book of Life of Jesus Christ, and compassion for His life and death.

The love of God is the greatest virtue, but in love itself lies both good and evil, and sin, because this feeling penetrates the soul much deeper than the rest. However, the Doctrine says that there are two types of love — evil, as “a diabolical and dangerous thing” (neighbor with neighbor), and good-spiritual between God and the soul. The love of God, if it is not supported by knowledge and discrimination, but is expressed with “thoughtless fervor, is quickly exhausted and deceived”. If the person, in the opinion of the Author of the Doctrine, considers himself in the love of God “so that God delivered him from bodily or temporal suffering” is hatred of God, love of carnal and worldly, as he loves earthly things for the good of the body, relatives — for the good and honour of men of the saints or spiritual — for the sake of “cloak of

holiness” (i.e., to the sanctity influenced the omission of sins, and protected from the wrath of God). Thus, the described love is impure, because it is a lust for the flesh and the body with its vices, because such a person loves the virtues of his body, can read and sing to the pleasure of others, has great knowledge to convince others with scientific arguments of reason, showing pride, receive a sense of comfort and spirituality.

Thus, divine love is not part of the “you to me, I to you” deal. All external sensations of the body and its interaction with other people are blamed.

The Author of the Doctrine has his own view of the nature of spiritual love, its development and transformation from the sublime to the “wrong”. As the text says, “some love their novice or their novice with a spiritual and perfect love, for they love them wholeheartedly in the Divine way”, but when such love grows too much, it becomes “wrong” if it is not controlled by the “weapon of great discrimination”. If there is no “distinction”, then love becomes carnal or useless, and sometimes harmful, when two people communicate too much with each other and waste their time uselessly. Such love, as you grow, “wants more to have the presence of the beloved”, and, receiving it, holistically transformed in the beloved — that is one nice, pleasantly different, and unpleasant for one, hate the other. Since “the soul cannot control the power of an ever-increasing love”, the two lovers begin to reveal their love to each other, saying that “there is no one in the world whom I love so much and carry so much in my heart”. However, in this case, there is always a “temptation in something illegal that can arise from such love”, although at first the mind resists this, but then it begins to darken, and the spirit becomes weak, and the person begins to believe that touching the beloved is not a sin, and this is permissible. Little by little, what was previously considered impossible becomes acceptable, because it is believed that a small sin is committed in the absence of an evil intention. However, as the feeling develops, “one lover begins to influence the will of the other” — one does everything that the other wants, which is absolutely not limited to reasonable limits, and so-follows “one lover to another, cannot resist and even encourages action”, knowing that it will be pleasant to the beloved. And then both lovers are distracted from prayer, abstinence, seclusion, and all the virtues, and all the divine love is transformed into their own love. But even this love changes lovers — words and the presence of the beloved are no longer enough, as it was before. One of the lovers has a “doubt” — is his beloved as much affected by love as he is? Such love between neighbor and neighbor, according to the author of the Doctrine, carries a great danger of developing into “wrong” love.

Thus, the Author of the Doctrine leads his followers to the idea that divine love does not develop like ordinary love. There is no desire to possess, no desire to control, no desire to influence the will of the beloved, no desire to obey.

What is the “distinction” that prevents “wrong” love and governs “good” love for God and neighbor? The distinction lies in the transformation of the soul into God, which can be threefold: “the soul is transformed into the will of God, with God and within God and itself”.

The first of these transformations occurs when “the soul seeks to imitate the life of the God-man-sufferer”, since this is the will of God himself. The second transformation occurs when the soul is united with God and not only loves God with its will, but also “experiences great feelings and pleasures about God.” The third transfiguration occurs when the soul is so transfigured within God, and God is within it, that it completely “dissolves its feelings in God”, which is impossible to express in words. In unity with God, the soul acquires wisdom and maturity, and together with them can control the love of God and neighbor.

Thus, first, the follower of the Doctrine is offered a test (mental and physical) of all the suffering that Jesus Christ endured out of love for people, compassion and compassion, and the desire to suffer as well. This usually manifested itself not only in the taming of the flesh, but also in self-scarring, in the deliberate self-mutilation, in the desire to be humiliated, spat at, and beaten by others. The second, more developed phase is a very interesting state of ecstasy, which is a habit: when thinking about God, there is satisfaction in the whole body. From the point of view of modern medicine, this state can be described by the constant release of endorphins into the blood in response to stress and the inclusion of an adaptation mechanism [Meerson 1988:101-106], which is characterized by a state of “happiness”, “bliss”. Constant exposure to stress leads to depletion of the body’s stress-limiting systems, heart rhythm disturbances, and ischemic myocardial damage [Meerson 1988:101-127].

The third stage (long-term stress exposure) is similar to deep fainting (comatose state)¹⁴: there is no sensitivity of the skin to external stimuli, reaction to sounds or someone else’s presence, a person who is in this state “cannot get up”. From the point of view of medicine, the result of stress, accompanied by a constant release of endorphins, malnutrition, the idea of self-blame and a depressed state, leads not only to the depletion of brain neurons, but also to the development of a major depressive disorder [Stahl 2017]. The criteria for diagnosis are very diverse¹⁵ [American Psychiatric Association

¹⁴ Sources often use the following definitions: “was exalted” or “was in ecstasy”.

¹⁵ To make a diagnosis of major depressive disorder, at least 5 of the following criteria must be present: 1. Depressive mood; 2. Insomnia or hypersomnia; 3. Significant weight loss in the absence of a diet or weight gain, or a decrease or increase in appetite; 4. Significantly reduced interest or loss of pleasure in all or almost all activities; 5. Reduced ability to concentrate, think, or hesitate; 6. Psychomotor agitation or delayed motor and mental activity; 7. A sense of worthlessness or excessive guilt; 8. Fatigue or loss of energy; 9. Recurrent thoughts of death, repetitive suicidal thoughts without a specific plan, or suicide attempts or a specific plan to commit suicide.

Symptoms should be present most of the day, almost every day. Note the symptoms can be both the patient and other people (they may notice, for example, the patient’s crying or slowness of speech and movement). The greatest severity of symptoms may occur in the morning or evening, depending on the course of the disease.

Ketoacidosis and ketoacidotic coma can also be the result of prolonged fasting and abstinence. The patient spreads the smell of “acetone” around him, which can be mistaken for “fragrance”.

2013:160-162]. However, in the historical time of writing, such diseases were interpreted in their own way: the soul saw “that each member of the body has its own infirmity” the soul tried to show “all the sins that it committed together with various members of the body”,¹⁶ and healing from bodily diseases was assumed through Jesus Christ [Karsavin 1918:104].

In contrast, the development of somatic diseases may not occur. Recent studies of spirituality/religiosity show a reverse trend if worship and belief occur in a positive way (without or after stressful effects), included in the treatment package. Thus, a positive perception of spirituality/religiosity contributes to feelings of gratitude, forgiveness, and compassion that reduce the degree of stress caused by the disease situation [Taratukhin 2017: 53].

Therefore, we can assume that some followers of the Doctrine managed to achieve a balance between the stressful risk factor for developing the disease and the positive impact of prayer communication with the divine.

On the one hand, the Doctrine has such a positive model: love for God has different properties, because “the soul in love with God softens, becomes weak and strengthens”. On the other hand, simple satisfaction with the realization of divine love (God loves me) is not the ultimate goal of a follower of the Doctrine¹⁷.

The soul transformed in God in the fullness of vision, according to the Author of the Doctrine, becomes inactive and does not perform any action of creation, but when it “returns to itself”, i.e. it separates from the divine, it tries to transform itself into the divine will, expressed in “acts of the cross and penitents”. This statement again mentions a kind of “swing”: the soul is in love unity, then again gets confused and tries to resist something (false visions, evil, other love). Such love is not a passive beginning, and “forced to

¹⁶ The listed sins that Christ cures were: infirmities of the head (for washing, combing, twisting, tinting, anointing, and decorating the hair), infirmities of the face (for anointing to show it to “pitiful people and seeking their favor”), infirmities of the eyes (for looking at the vain and harmful, getting pleasure from it and speaking against God), diseases of the ears (for listening to the vain and harmful, getting pleasure from it and speaking against God), diseases of the mouth, and throat (for delighting in food and drink, delicious viands), weakness of the tongue (for reproaches, slander, ridicule, curses, blasphemy, lying, perjury), disease of the neck (behind the excitement of her anger, pride and lechery), weakness of the back and shoulders (for wearing “different” like jewelry and clothes are unnecessary — against God), diseases of hands (many thin hugs and touches and for committing bad deeds), heart disease (anger, envy, sorrow, bad love, lust, and lust), weakness of the legs (for dancing and “slutty” walking and wearing shoes with ship spouts and windows), weakness of the whole body (in experiencing fun and pleasure, restful sleep and peace).

¹⁷ In the beginning, the soul is searching for Divine consolations, so it relents, accepts what is given to it by God — “consolations, wonderful and inexpressible”, — that make the soul “run after the Beloved”, seek “only the Beloved”. The more sensations and consolations the soul has, the more it becomes infirm if it “does not have the presence of the Beloved.” After the soul learns the truth, it begins to consider itself unworthy of any good or gift of God, and then “relies in it a wonderful wisdom and maturity”, so the soul is strengthened in the readiness of unity with the Beloved, for which it would “go to death”. This love makes the soul imitate the God-man-sufferer, who is Lover and Beloved, so, according to the Author of the Doctrine, the lover of Jesus Christ seeks to transform himself into Him and his morals, to do what would be pleasant to Him and to become like Him in a way of life.

follow the road of the cross” i.e. forcing a person to commit “a long repentance”. It does not bring “laughter to the lips, nor does it become disorderly in eating or drinking, nor does it bring a certain vivacity of vanity”; it submits itself to the law which it believes itself to be. Based on this Author’s statement, we can assume that the external emotional manifestations of the follower of the Doctrine should not be — laughter, activity in actions, haste in food, which are considered, from the modern point of view, a positive manifestation of everyday religious feelings (joy, peace and harmony) [Taratukhin 2017:54, *Underwood* 2011].

The constant search for “comfort from the Beloved” can also be explained by the desire to maintain a pleasant state “in divine love”. Like drug intoxication, the follower begins to experience such states more often and more qualitatively. The life of such a follower of the Doctrine seems to be divided: he is in “comfort”, when his action ends, then all his time he begins to look for “dope”: there is a long repentance-fasting, prayer, humiliation of the body.

Mystical and religious experience based on visions, which was previously associated with the diagnosis of psychosis or schizophrenia, in recent studies, it is proposed to allocate a separate problem (Mystical Religious Experience, MRE) and consider it not as a “disease” (a disease that began under the influence of external influences or genetic abnormalities), but as a “state” (caused by a person’s desire) with a set of clearly defined features in the terminology of psychiatric science: 1. delirium, 2. hallucinations, 3. disorganized speech (for example, confusion and inconsistency, 4. gross disorganization in space or catatonia [DeHoff 2018]. Attempts are also made to return to the understanding of this experience in the form of a three-part model with a vertical ratio (body, soul, spirit). In this case, God is seen as a subject that combines some experience, and as an object. As a subject, God initiates experience and is active in it, but as an object, he is knowable. Following his experience, man uses the object-God to perfect his ever-evolving internalized view of God [DeHoff 2018:222].

However, research in this area should be continued, if not mystical point of view (the existence of God-the interlocutor), with the scientific: the ability of the human psyche to relive a mystical experience, not giving him personal volitional influence, or in the form of collaboration of scientists of different specializations.

Properties of lovers

There are three properties of lovers, according to the Author of the Doctrine, the first of which is to be “transformed into the will of the Beloved”. If it is Jesus Christ, then his will is the life shown in Scripture, “in poverty, sorrow, humiliation, and obedience”. The second property is to be transformed into the properties of the

beloved, namely, “love for all creatures, true humility and goodness, immutability”, because the closer the soul is to God, the less it should be changed. The third property is a complete transformation into God, that is, a complete transformation into God. “the soul is freed from temptations, changes, and its own will” when it is entirely in the divine.

This is a very important argument that points to the next step (the stage of initiation). At this point, the true love received in the cognition of the divine must fill the consciousness of the follower of the Doctrine, replacing the void left after the rejection of all earthly goods and external worries brought by the surrounding society. The known object (God) also becomes a subject and produces a response in relation to the person.

The essay identifies characters of love: Lover subordinates his will to the will of the Beloved, “love makes you leave all other friendship”, which can be opposite (to leave father, mother, sister, brother, and all other affections), nothing can remain hidden in one, which he couldn’t open another, “Lover tries to resemble the Beloved” — so that if the Beloved of the poor, he is poor if despicable, he is despicable, if the same — mourning, he will be sorrowful. Then “love between two lovers is equal”, but a sample of one of the lovers is already taken — Jesus Christ, so the Doctrine again is the idea that you need to get closer to this ideal — if one of the lovers is rich, he must be poor, if read, it needs to be despicable, and if good, it should be overflowing with sorrow, and then perhaps the union with the Beloved will be possible.

Thus, divine love (according to intellectuals¹⁸ of the end of the XIII century, the beginning of the XIV century) assumes: 1. Complete renunciation of the outside world. 2. Rejection of the basic needs of the body (food, sleep). 3. Constantly maintaining yourself in a state of ecstasy (receiving visions and revelations).

And the ultimate goal of all these spiritual exercises is to transfer the soul from one vessel (body) to another (divine light), which happens much faster if you follow the Doctrine. The hidden desire for suicide is disguised as a process of “soul transformation” with the promise of “unearthly bliss”, for which at the very beginning you need to suffer a little.

The ordeals and gifts

Since the main idea of the Doctrine is to unite with the divine through “great love”, the arguments repeatedly mention the ordeals

¹⁸ This term is used by the author of the article in this passage for a reason: attempts to interpret divine love, for example, are made in the writings of Raymond Llull and Arnold of Villanova, already mentioned above, as well as many others who have discussed divine love in their treatises. Let us add that the authorship of the work of Angela of Foligno, or, for example, Marguerite of Porete, can be questioned — these women did not receive the level of education that would allow them to write their works; and this is the subject of a separate study.

that the followers of this Doctrine must pass. however, the above has analyzed the mystical component of this process, but quite a few arguments have been devoted to how the followers should behave in the socio-cultural aspect, i.e. how a person (as a whole) who wishes to enter the path of internal transformation should behave in their daily life.

The Doctrine says that “earthly ordeals must be overcome with patience and joy, because only ordeals turn to God, make them develop and grow, produce fruits, purify and calm; and the joy of the Kingdom of Heaven is acquired by poverty, sorrow, torment and persecution”. For successful completion of such ordeals, special gifts are given¹⁹.

This part of the Doctrine is given as the resulting chapter, which should show the follower exactly what preferences he will receive after going through all the stages of renouncing worldly goods. The first gift replaces the feeling of human love and emotional response to suffering with love for Jesus Christ, which is promised to be mutual. The second gift is related to the first: if the soul is humiliated and blamed by the external environment, then the only one who does not judge it and sympathizes with it is God. Thus, a person must completely “lock in” on communion with the divine. The third gift may seem strange from the point of view of modern man—the desire for incessant torment not only from the external environment, from which, in theory, the soul has already renounced, but also the torments experienced by Jesus Christ and the Virgin. However, this can be explained from a physiological point of view: in the previous steps, the principle of suffering-receiving pleasure is laid down. Accordingly, as soon as the level of “pleasure” decreases, the “torment” begins immediately, and certain steps must be taken to achieve pleasure again. In the fourth gift, the desire for humiliation is repeated, but in a different way: the more a person tries to possess something, the less he seems to himself to possess it, in modern language — he cultivates a sense of insecurity in himself and in his own powers, but this feeling, according to the Author of the Doctrine, is a good and divine gift. Feelings of fear, anxiety, depression, helplessness, or despondency that lead a person to refuse to perform any actions are extolled as an ideal substrate for communicating with the divine, and this explains the person’s desire

¹⁹ The first is the love of poverty, so that the soul of man is deprived of love for every creature and wants nothing more to possess and love no one else but Jesus Christ.

With the second gift, the soul wants to be humiliated, despised, and blamed by every creature, and wants every creature to consider it reprehensible.

Third, the soul wants to suffer and suffer punishment, not only in the process of its own reflections on the torments of the body and heart of Jesus Christ and the virgin.

The fourth gift is to consider oneself unworthy or not successful in achieving the good.

The fifth gift is to constantly think with prayer “as it was in Christ.”

The sixth gift involves avoiding everything that does not allow you to accept all of the above gifts, everything that is different and opposite to these gifts.

The seventh gift is not to judge anyone, but not to prevent others from judging you.

to constantly remain in prayerful ecstasy. The quality of this ecstatic state is indicated by the fifth gift: being like Jesus Christ, the follower of the Doctrine mentally and sensually reproduces not only his life and actions, but also his thoughts, trying to understand what the heart of Jesus Christ was filled with — what thoughts or emotions; imitates exactly what he achieved in the course of reflection. Receiving the sixth gift gives the believer confidence in receiving all of the above gifts. It is also associated with the seventh — “do not judge anyone”. Here it is necessary to add: condemnation is a manifestation of pride (I do everything correctly, and others do not), but in order for this feeling to appear, you need to distract yourself from inner contemplation and notice the nearest “brother” who follows the same path. Accordingly, “non-condemnation” as a gift can be interpreted as complete indifference to everything that surrounds it.

Thus, the specified way of realization inherently justifies anti-social (in the modern sense and in the understanding of society of the XIII and XVI centuries) behavior and actions, indicating that they lead to the highest beginning and getting all sorts of benefits. The highest degree of realization of the Doctrine is offered internally — constant communication with the divine, externally — the lack of reaction to the surrounding world. The soul controls the mind, the body, and their reactions, respectively, if it is “busy”, then the other two components that come into contact with the outside world are inert.

Conclusion

Based on this research, we can assume that the third part of “The book of Revelations...”, which provides the basics of Doctrine for a group of believers, is a unique document that tells about the way to merge the soul with the divine for its salvation and improvement. The essay attempts to understand the message of the Holy Scripture, which describes the life and death of Jesus Christ, and formulates a new path to self-improvement. The Doctrine is based on a different way of life of a human being, which is completely opposite to the materialistic philosophical approach, and sets out completely different social and cultural social values.

In “The book of Revelations...”, instead of lengthy arguments, step by step describes the path to the divine cognition through an increasing sense of “passionate” love. Such love is produced by inner communion with the divine, when God is appointed to the role of the Beloved, and the follower of the Doctrine becomes Lover.

The path to divine love is a clearly defined teaching with certain stages of “initiation” through which the follower passes, and at each such stage acquires a certain state.

The first stage: the feeling of an invisible presence that resonates not only in the soul, but also in the body²⁰. The second stage: rejection of earthly goods and satisfaction of human needs, thinking about yourself as a sinner, being in sorrow for the sufferings of Christ presuppose the achievement of “divine good” (fullness of thoughts about God) and encourage actions: reading the Scriptures and prayers. Gradually there is a “liberation from the mundane”, a person begins to enjoy his new state. The third stage: fullness of love of God and for God. This love is divided into wrong (bad) and good. The first leads to doubt, and the follower of the Doctrine is not perfected, and the second — develops not as ordinary love, but ends with “the dissolution of the senses in God.” The fourth stage: complete renunciation of the external world, rejection of basic needs, permanent stay in ecstasy.

Thus, the physical sensation of the divine presence (or Holy Spirit), for example, through smell, touch, revelation, is only the initial stage. On believed offered long-term work on oneself, and in different sources, describing, for example, separate groups of believers or their everyday behavior, you can meet people at different stages of “self-perfection”: one only distributes the property and while listening to sermons, another is already involved in a joint patch of the cult, and the third went to live in the community, having broken all ties with the outside world, the fourth is not out of prayerful ecstasy. Community members who follow a particular teaching, such as bl. Angela, whose “The book of Revelations...” is considered in this study, spent the last years of her life in such a community and performed all the actions that are laid down in the Doctrine.

The described roles of Lover and Beloved do not relate to any gender distinction, although attempts are made to present them as such: for example, some historical studies of the sexual behavior of women who took the vow of brides of Christ, consider it as an attempt to avoid social pressure or a manifestation of deviant sexuality [Lochrie 1997:180-200], losing sight of the fact that the basis of this phenomenon was not unique and practiced only by women mystics.

Within the framework of this analytical article, love relationships are considered when the object (subject) of love is invisible and is present materially only in images, oral and written culture. At the same time, feelings and emotions are directed at him, and he is “cognizable” through them, and is also able to generate feelings of his material presence in response. The study of the “cognizable presence of the Beloved” in various sources and other texts, which

²⁰ The experience of spirituality or religious unity may include a sense of joy, delight, and elevation from “unity with the world”, from Church service, and from the beauty of the world around us. Somatic feeling in the context of spirituality can manifest as “goosebumps”, “delight in the stomach, like a slide”, “free breath” [Taratukhin 2017: 54].

set out practical recommendations for achieving junction with the divine, is quite promising.

This study is important in practical application not only for specialists-historians who study the development of religious communities in the late XII century — early XIV century, but also for scientists of other specialties, such as psychologists and doctors, in modern life, faced with the treatment of changes in sexual or social behavior under the influence of religious beliefs (or religious associations, sects).

Relationships and Activities: not.

References

1. American Psychiatric Association 2013 – American Psychiatric Association (2013) *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders*. Fifth Edition (DSM-5). Arlington, VA: American Psychiatric Publishing. p. 992. ISBN 978-0-89042-554-1, 978-0-89042-555-8, 0-89042-554-X.
2. Acta Sanctorum — *Acta Sanctorum*. Januarius IV Januarii, Angela de Fulgino.
3. Bailey 2003 — Bailey, M. D. (2003) Religious Poverty, Mendicancy, and Reform in the Late Middle Ages. *Church History*. Sep2003, Vol. 72 Issue 3, pp. 457-483. doi: 10.1017/S0009640700100319
4. Burr 1993 — Burr, D. (1993) *Olivi's peaceable kingdom: a reading of the Apocalypse commentary*. University of Pennsylvania Press. p. 280. ISBN 0812232275, 9780812232271.
5. Burr 2001 — Burr, D. (2001) *The Spiritual Franciscans*. The Pennsylvania State University Press. p. 428.
6. Burunat 2019 — Burunat, E. (2019) Love is a physiological motivation (like hunger, thirst, sleep or sex). *Med Hypotheses*.;129:109225. doi: 10.1016/j.mehy.2019.05.011.
7. DeHoff 2018 — DeHoff, S. L. (2018) *Psychosis or Mystical Religious Experience? A New Paradigm Grounded in Psychology and Reformed Theology*. Boston University Boston, MA, USA. ISBN 978-3-319-68260-0, 978-3-319-68261-7. doi:10.1007/978-3-319-68261-7.
8. Field 2012 — Field, S. L. (2012) *The beguine, the angel and the inquisitor: the trials of Marguerite Porete and Guiard of Cressonessart*. University of Notre Dame, Indiana. p. 408. ISBN 978-0-268-02892-3.
9. Gioacchino da Fiore 1994 — Gioacchino da Fiore (1994) *Sull'Apocalisse* (a cura di Andrea Tagliapietra). Feltrinelli. Milano. ISBN 88-07-82089-7.
10. Lochrie 1997 — *Constructing medieval sexuality* (1997). Eds. Karma Lochrie, Peggy McCracken, James A. Schultz. Medieval Cultures. Volume 11. University of Minnesota Press. Minneapolis. London, p. 206. ISBN 0-8166-2829-7.
11. Ramón Lull (1923) — Lull, R. (1923) *The Book of the Lover and the Beloved*. Translated from the Catalan of Ramón Lull with an Introductory essay by E. Allison Peers London Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge New York And Toronto. The Macmillan Company <https://ia801009.us.archive.org/9/items/bookoffloverbelov00lul/bookoffloverbelov00lul.pdf>
12. Ortigue 2010 — Ortigue, S., Bianchi-Demicheli, F., Patel, N., Frum, C., and Lewis, J.W. (2010). Neuroimaging of love: fMRI meta-analysis evidence toward new perspectives in sexual medicine. *The Journal Of Sexual Medicine*, 7, 11: 3541-52. doi:10.1111/j.1743-6109.2010.01999.x.
13. Rodionova 2014 — Rodionova, Y. V. (2014) Community of Franciscan Tertiary in Foligno in the Second Half of the 13th Century (Italy). In *Religious confraternities in the Middle Ages and the modern era (until the end of the 18th century)*. Kielce. Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Jana Kochanowskiego. p. 420. ISBN 978-83-7133-598-3.
14. Stegman 1909 — *The Book of the Divine Consolation of Bd Angela of Foligno* (1909) Ed. Mary G. Stegman.
15. Stahl 2017 — Stahl, S. M., Morrisette, D. A., Faedda, G., Fava, M., Goldberg, J. F., Keck, P. E., Lee, Y., Malhi, G., Marangoni, C., McElroy, S. L., Ostacher, M., Rosenblat, J. D., Solé, E., Suppes, T., Takeshima, M., Thase, M. E., Vieta, E., Young, A., Zimmerman, M., McIntyre, R. S. (2017) Guidelines for the recognition and management of mixed depression. *CNS Spectrums*. April (vol. 22, no. 2). pp. 203-219. doi:10.1017/S1092852917000165.
16. Tagliapietra 2013 — Tagliapietra A. (2013) *Gioacchino da Fiore e la filosofia*. il Prato. Saonara (PD). ISBN 978-88-6336-203-9.
17. Ubertino da Casale 1485 — Ubertino da Casale (1485) *Arbor vitae crucifixae Jesu Christi*. Venezia, Andrea de Bonettis. Ospitato su Biblioteca de Catalunya. URL <http://mdc.csuc.cat/cdm/ref/collection/incunableBC/id/136400>
18. Underwood, L. G. (2011) The Daily Spiritual Experience Scale: Overview and Results. *Religions*, 2(4), 29-50. doi:10.3390/rel2010029
19. Gregory of Nyssa 2000 — Gregory of Nyssa (2000) On the life of Moses the lawgiver, or perfection in virtue. Part II. *Anthology. Eastern Fathers and teachers Of the Church of the fourth century*. Volume II. Publishing house of MFTI. pp. 257-328. (In Russ.)
20. Gregory (Palama) 2007 — Gregory (Palama) (2007) *Triads in defense of the sacred-silent*. Moscow-SPb. Nauka. p. 432. ISBN: 5-02-026874-7, 978-5-02-026292-8. (In Russ.)
21. Descartes 1989 — Descartes, R. (1989) Reasoning about the method to guide your mind correctly and find the truth in the Sciences. Translation into Russian by G. G. Slyusarev and A. P. Yushkevich. *Essays*, in 2 vols. M., Thought. ISBN: 5-244-00022-5. (In Russ.)
22. Dionysius the Areopagite 1994 — Dionysius the Areopagite (1994) *On divine names. On mystical theology*. Preparation of G. M. Prokhorov, translation editor: A. I. Zaitsev. SPb.: Verb. p. 378. ISBN 5-85381-023-5. (In Russ.)
23. Origins of franciscanism 1996 — *Origins of franciscanism* (1996) Ed. E. Karolyi in Russian. Spiritual library. p. 1060. (In Russ.)
24. History of subjectivity 2009 — *History of subjectivity. Medieval Europe* (2009). Comp. Yu. P. Zaretsky. Suppl. journal Middle ages. M. Academic Project; Gaudeamus. p. 565. ISBN 978-5-8291-1026-0, 978-5-98426-078-7. (In Russ.)
25. Karsavin 1918 — *Revelations of blessed Angela* (1918). Transl. L. P. Karsavin. M., Reissued: Tomsk: Vodoley, 1997. Kyiv, Ucm Press, 1996, p. 224. (In Russ.)
26. Kotlyarevsky 1901 — Kotlyarevsky, S. A. (1901) *Franciscan order and Roman Curia in the XIII-XIV centuries*. M. p. 396. (In Russ.)
27. Lossky 2012 — Lossky, V. N. (2012) *Essay on the mystical theology of the Eastern Church. Dogmatic theology*. Tr. fr. mon. Magdalene (V. A. Reschikova). 2nd ed. STSL. p. 586. ISBN 978-5-903102-36-5. (In Russ.)
28. Meerson 1988 — Meerson, F. Z., Pshennikova M. G. (1988) *Adaptation to stressful situations and physical exertion*. M.: Medicine. c. 256. (In Russ.)
29. Taratukhin 2017 — Taratukhin, E.O. (2017) Spirituality and religiosity in a context of psychosocial cardiovascular risk factors. *Cardiovascular Therapy and Prevention*, 16(3), 52-55. doi:10.15829/1728-8800-2017-3-52-55 (In Russ.)